

BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION

In the matter of

Complaint No. PF-1-Edu/PMC-2022(FMH-HJ-Stipend)

House Officers (Batch 2022) Vs. Principal, FMH College of Medicine & Dentistry & Medical Director, Fatima Memorial Hospital

Prof. Dr. Naqib Ullah Achakzai

Chairman

Prof. Dr. Noshad Ahmad Shaikh

Member

Mr. Jawad Amin Khan

Member

Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor

Secretary

Present:

House Officers (Batch 2022)

Complainants

Ms. Ayesha Masood (Representative)

Respondent No. 1

Mr. Arif Kabani (Representative)

Respondent No. 2

Hearing dated

21.11.2022

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

1. Pakistan Medical Commission (the "Commission") has received multiple complaints from the House Officers working at the Fatima Memorial Hospital, Lahore. All the complaints received at the Commission are pertaining to the under-payment of stipend to the House officers working at the Fatima Memorial Hospital. A letter of explanation was sent to the Principal of the FMH College of Medicine and Dentistry, Lahore, which responded by seeking two-weeks' time for compliance. However, no compliance has been conveyed to the Commission and due to the unsatisfactory conduct of the College, the instant matter is placed before this Committee.



II. LETTER SENT TO THE FMH COLLEGE OF MEDICINE & DENTISTRY

2. In view of the multiple Complaints received at the Commission, letter dated 19.09.2022 was issued to the Principal, FMH College of Medicine and Dentistry, in the following terms:

"Pakistan Medical Commission is in receipt of multiple complaints from house officers of Fatima Memorial Hospital wherein they have alleged that they are being paid stipend much less than that prescribed by the Government of Punjab (complaints attached with the letter).

It is it is to inform you that as per Government of Punjab Order No.SO (ND12-26/2022 dated 7th September 2022, the stipend of the House Officers has been revised from PKR 45,070/- to PKR 57.605/- per month with effect from 1" July 2022 (The order is attached for your reference). You are required to ensure the payment of the stipend as per notified rates by the Government of Punjab and are also directed to pay the arrears according to the date mentioned in the Order.

You are further required to submit a compliance report within three (03) days of receipt of this letter. In case of failure; the PMC will take the action according to Law."

III. REPLY OF FMH COLLEGE OF MEDICINE & DENTISTRY

3. The Medical Director of Fatima Memorial Hospital, Principal of the FMH College of Dentistry and Principal of FMH College of Medicine and Dentistry submitted their joint response dated 22.09.2022, to the Commission, wherein they contended that:

"This is to apprise you that our financial team has started to work out for compliance in true letter and spirit as soon as possible. Therefore, it is requested that a time of two weeks may kindly be given to reassess our cash flows for execution in accordance with the aforesaid letter."

4. Thereafter, no compliance report was submitted by the Respondent College.

IV. HEARING



- 5. In view of the noncompliance of the directions of the Commission, the matter was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee on 21.11.2022. Notices dated 16.11.2022 were issued to the Respondents directing them to appear before the Disciplinary Committee on 21.11.2022. The aggrieved House Officer were also informed to attend the hearing of Disciplinary Committee on 21.11.2022.
- 6. The Complainants (House Officers of FMH) as well as the representatives of the Respondents, appeared before the Disciplinary Committee on the date of hearing.
- 7. The Complainants presented their complaints against the Respondents, all pertaining to the underpayment of stipend to House Officers of the batch of 2022 working at Fatima Memorial Hospital.
- 8. Ms. Ayesha Masood and Mr. Arif Kabani appeared on behalf of Respondents and submitted that the College had requested for additional time for compliance through an earlier letter dated 22.09.2022. They tendered an apology to the Commission for persistent non-compliance and requested for additional time to implement the increase of stipend, due to substantial incremental amount.

V. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

- 9. The Disciplinary Committee has perused the relevant record and heard the submissions of the parties in the instant Complaint and has gone through the complaints of the House Officers and the statements made by the Respondents today.
- 10. The Disciplinary Committee observes that the Commission was intimated by the Respondents on 22.09.2022 that the stipend amount paid to the House officers shall be increased in light of applicable provisions within two weeks. It is concerning to note with displeasure that two months have passed since this assurance of the Respondents and even today the Respondents have requested for additional time to implement the increase in payable House-Job stipends.
- 11. It is evident from the PMC Act 2020 and the PMC Medical and Dental Undergraduate Education (Admissions, Curriculum and Conduct) Policy and Regulations 2022-23 (the "Admission Regulations") that all graduating students are entitled to become House Officers at the affiliated



Teaching Hospital of their institute of graduation. It is necessary to refer to the guiding section 27 (2) of the PMC Act 2020, as under:

"Every medical or dental college in Pakistan shall be responsible to provide a paid house job, at its own affiliated teaching hospital to all of its graduates have acquired a provisional license. Failure to provide a house job shall result in the medical or dental college reimbuing the stipend paid to the graduate by the training hospital where the graduate obtains house job training:

Provided that in the event the graduate opts voluntarily to pursue training in any other teaching hospital, their salary or stipend shall not be the responsibility of the medical or dental college of the graduate:

Provided further that the stipend or salary paid to house officers shall be determined by the Provincial Government or Federal Government as applicable for public colleges end private colleges shall pay a stipend or salary not being less than the amounts applicable to public colleges. ..."

- 12. Further, Regulation 23 of the PMC Medical and Dental Undergraduate Education (Admissions, Curriculum and Conduct) Policy and Regulations 2022-23 (the "Admission Regulations"), the relevant provision is reproduced as under:
 - "... Payment of Stipend to House Officers. -(l) Every public teaching hospital shall pay a stipend to each house officer as prescribed by the Provincial or Federal Government under whose control the public teaching hospital operates.
 - (2) Each private teaching hospital shall pay a stipend to a house officer being not less than the stipend payable to public teaching hospitals ...
- 13. In light of the fore-going and being mindful of the lapse of time, the Disciplinary Committee decides that Respondents shall comply with the latest Notified House Job stipend issued by Specialized Healthcare & Medical Education Department of the Government of Punjab. The Respondents shall submit a compliance report within seven (07) days from the receipt of this decision.



14. Accordingly, the instant proceedings stand disposed of.

Prof. Dr. Noshad Ahmad Shaikh

Mr. Jawad Amin Khan

Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor

Member

Member

Secretary

Prof. Dr. Naqib Ullah Achakzai

Chairman

21/11 December, 2022